

## Proof

Given that  $a, b$  &  $c$  are positive numbers, prove that  $\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c}$  when  $a < b$ .

[Given that  $a, b$  &  $c$  are positive numbers, prove that  $\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c}$  when  $a < b$ .]

(1) What is wrong with the following:

$$\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c} \Rightarrow a(b+c) < b(a+c) \text{ (as } b > 0 \text{ \& } b+c > 0)$$

$$\Rightarrow ac < bc \Rightarrow a < b \text{ (as } c > 0)$$

[Given that  $a, b$  &  $c$  are positive numbers, prove that  $\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c}$  when  $a < b$ .]

(2) What is wrong with the following:

$$\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c} \Leftrightarrow a(b+c) < b(a+c) \text{ (as } b > 0 \text{ \& } b+c > 0)$$

$$\Leftrightarrow ac < bc \Leftrightarrow a < b \text{ (as } c > 0)$$

Given that  $a, b$  &  $c$  are positive numbers, prove that  $\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c}$   
when  $a < b$ .]

Improved solution:

$$\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c} \Leftrightarrow a(b+c) < b(a+c) \text{ (as } b > 0 \text{ \& } b+c > 0)$$

$$\Leftrightarrow ac < bc \Leftrightarrow a < b \text{ (as } c > 0)$$

So  $a < b \Rightarrow \frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c}$  ; ie  $\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c}$  when  $a < b$ , as required.

The following are equivalent:

[Given that  $a, b$  &  $c$  are positive numbers]

(a)  $\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c} \Leftrightarrow a < b$  [implies and is implied by]

(b)  $\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c}$  if and only if  $a < b$  [ought to be “only if and if”]

(c)  $\frac{a}{b} < \frac{a+c}{b+c}$  is a necessary & sufficient condition for  $a < b$

[ought to be “is a sufficient & necessary condition for”]

Given that  $n$  is a positive integer, prove that  $n$  is odd if and only if  $n^2$  is odd.

[Given that  $n$  is a positive integer, prove that  $n$  is odd if and only if  $n^2$  is odd.]

### Solution

**Part 1:** To prove that  $n$  is odd  $\Rightarrow n^2$  is odd

If  $n$  is odd, then it can be written as  $2m + 1$ , for some integer  $m$ .

Then  $n^2 = (2m + 1)^2 = 4m^2 + 4m + 1 = 2(2m^2 + 2m) + 1$ ,

so that  $n^2$  is odd.

Thus  $n$  is odd  $\Rightarrow n^2$  is odd; ie  $n$  is odd only if  $n^2$  is odd.

**Part 2:** To prove that  $n^2$  is odd  $\Rightarrow n$  is odd

[Proof by contradiction]

If  $n^2$  is odd, suppose that  $n$  is even. Then  $n = 2m$ , for some integer  $m$ .

But then  $n^2 = (2m)^2 = 4m^2$ , which is divisible by 2, and so even.

This contradicts the fact that  $n^2$  is odd, and so  $n$  must be odd.

Thus  $n^2$  is odd  $\Rightarrow n$  is odd; ie  $n$  is odd if  $n^2$  is odd.

[Alternatively, prove that “ $n$  not odd  $\Rightarrow n^2$  is not odd”]

So  $n$  is odd if and only if  $n^2$  is odd.

If  $x > 1$ , show that  $x - \sqrt{x^2 - 1} < 1$



[If  $x > 1$ , show that  $x - \sqrt{x^2 - 1} < 1$ ]

**Solution**

Suppose that  $x - \sqrt{x^2 - 1} \geq 1$  (\*)

Then  $x - 1 \geq \sqrt{x^2 - 1}$

and so, as the RHS is non-negative,  $(x - 1)^2 \geq x^2 - 1$

$\Rightarrow -2x + 1 \geq -1$

$\Rightarrow 2 \geq 2x$

$\Rightarrow x \leq 1$ , which contradicts the fact that  $x > 1$ .

Thus (\*) is not possible, and so  $x - \sqrt{x^2 - 1} < 1$ .

Show that if  $X > 1$  &  $Y > 1$ , then  $X + Y < XY + 1$

[Show that if  $X > 1$  &  $Y > 1$ , then  $X + Y < XY + 1$ ]

**Solution**

$$X + Y < XY + 1 \Leftrightarrow X + Y - XY - 1 < 0$$

$$\Leftrightarrow X(1 - Y) + Y - 1 < 0$$

$$\Leftrightarrow (X - 1)(1 - Y) < 0$$

$$\Leftrightarrow (X - 1)(Y - 1) > 0$$

$$\text{Then } X > 1 \text{ \& } Y > 1 \Rightarrow (X - 1)(Y - 1) > 0 \Rightarrow X + Y < XY + 1$$

## Devices for “If and only if proofs”

eg “A & B are true if and only if C, D & E are true” (\*)

Device 1: Suppose that  $A \Leftrightarrow C$  can be proved.

Then (\*) reduces to “B is true if and only if D & E are true”

Device 2: It may be possible to assert that A and C are equivalent.

(eg “a quadratic equation has repeated roots”  $\equiv$  “ $b^2 = 4ac$ ”)

Device 3: Show that  $A \Rightarrow C$  and  $C \Rightarrow A$

Device 4: Show that “ $B \Rightarrow D \ \& \ E$  are true” and that (eg) “B not true  $\Rightarrow$  at least one of  $D \ \& \ E$  is not true”

Device 5: Break down B not true into different cases

(eg for distinct roots: (i) one root equal to 0 (ii) both negative (iii) both positive) (iv) one negative & one positive)