

STEP 2018, P1, Q12 - Solution (3 pages; 14/5/20)

$$(i) P(\text{Head}) = \sum_{i=1}^3 P(\text{coin } i \text{ is drawn}) \times P(\text{coin } i \text{ shows Head})$$

$$= \frac{1}{3}p_1 + \frac{1}{3}p_2 + \frac{1}{3}p_3 = \frac{1}{3}(p_1 + p_2 + p_3)$$

(ii) $[N_1 \sim B(2, p) \Rightarrow E(N_1) = 2p$ & $Var(N_1) = 2p(1 - p)$ and, according to the Examiner's Report, it was acceptable to just quote these must be quoted.]

$$E(N_1) = 1.P(1 \text{ Head from 2 coins})$$

$$+ 2.(2 \text{ Heads from 2 coins})$$

$$= 2p(1 - p) + 2p^2 = 2p$$

$$E(N_1^2) = 1^2.P(1 \text{ Head from 2 coins})$$

$$+ 2^2.P(2 \text{ Heads from 2 coins})$$

$$= 2p(1 - p) + 4p^2 = 2p + 2p^2$$

$$Var(N_1) = E(N_1^2) - [E(N_1)]^2$$

$$= 2p + 2p^2 - 4p^2$$

$$= 2p(1 - p)$$

$$(iii) E(N_2) = 1.P(1 \text{ Head from the 2 coins})$$

$$+ 2.(2 \text{ Heads from the 2 coins})$$

$$= \{P(\text{Coins 1 \& 2 are chosen}). (p_1(1 - p_2) + (1 - p_1)p_2)$$

$$+ P(\text{Coins 1 \& 3 are chosen}). (p_1(1 - p_3) + (1 - p_1)p_3)$$

$$+ P(\text{Coins 2 \& 3 are chosen}). (p_2(1 - p_3) + (1 - p_2)p_3)\}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&+2\{P(\text{Coins 1 \& 2 are chosen}) \cdot p_1 p_2 \\
&+P(\text{Coins 1 \& 3 are chosen}) \cdot p_1 p_3 \\
&+P(\text{Coins 2 \& 3 are chosen}) \cdot p_2 p_3\} \\
&= \left\{ \frac{1}{3}(p_1(1-p_2) + (1-p_1)p_2) \right. \\
&+ \frac{1}{3}(p_1(1-p_3) + (1-p_1)p_3) \\
&+ \left. \frac{1}{3}(p_2(1-p_3) + (1-p_2)p_3) \right\} \\
&+ 2\left\{ \frac{1}{3}p_1 p_2 + \frac{1}{3}p_1 p_3 + \frac{1}{3}p_2 p_3 \right\} \\
&= \frac{1}{3}(2p_1 + 2p_2 + 2p_3) = 2p
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
E(N_2^2) &= \left\{ \frac{1}{3}(p_1(1-p_2) + (1-p_1)p_2) \right. \\
&+ \frac{1}{3}(p_1(1-p_3) + (1-p_1)p_3) \\
&+ \left. \frac{1}{3}(p_2(1-p_3) + (1-p_2)p_3) \right\} \\
&+ 4\left\{ \frac{1}{3}p_1 p_2 + \frac{1}{3}p_1 p_3 + \frac{1}{3}p_2 p_3 \right\} \\
&= \frac{1}{3}(2p_1 + 2p_2 + 2p_3 + 2p_1 p_2 + 2p_1 p_3 + 2p_2 p_3) \\
&= 2p + \frac{2}{3}(p_1 p_2 + p_1 p_3 + p_2 p_3)
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Var}(N_2) &= E(N_2^2) - [E(N_2)]^2 \\
&= 2p + \frac{2}{3}(p_1 p_2 + p_1 p_3 + p_2 p_3) - 4p^2
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{(iv) } \text{Var}(N_1) - \text{Var}(N_2) &= \\
&= 2p(1-p) - \left\{2p + \frac{2}{3}(p_1p_2 + p_1p_3 + p_2p_3) - 4p^2\right\} \\
&= 2p^2 - \frac{2}{3}(p_1p_2 + p_1p_3 + p_2p_3) \\
&= \frac{2}{9}(p_1 + p_2 + p_3)^2 - \frac{2}{3}(p_1p_2 + p_1p_3 + p_2p_3) \\
&= \frac{2}{9}(p_1^2 + p_2^2 + p_3^2) - \frac{2}{9}(p_1p_2 + p_1p_3 + p_2p_3) \\
&= \frac{1}{9}((p_1 - p_2)^2 + (p_1 - p_3)^2 + (p_2 - p_3)^2),
\end{aligned}$$

which is positive, unless $p_1 = p_2 = p_3$,

giving $\text{Var}(N_1) \leq \text{Var}(N_2)$, as required.